

## Tornero, Melina

---

**From:** Zack Frymier <zfrymier@ohiochamber.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 02, 2019 3:41 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina  
**Subject:** RE: For budget omnibus amendment

Melina,

Thank you for sending this along. Generally the amendment looks good but I do have a concern with one of Aida's comments below. The statement that nature and ecosystems do not have standing currently contradicts what the Lake Erie Bill of Rights, which is current law in Toledo, states. Language in this amendment stating that they do not have standing is essential to what we're trying to accomplish.

If we could get that added I would be very grateful.

Thanks and let me know if you have any questions,  
Zack

**From:** Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov <Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov>  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 2, 2019 2:06 PM  
**To:** Zack Frymier <zfrymier@ohiochamber.com>  
**Subject:** FW: For budget omnibus amendment

Hí Zach,

LSC sent this to me as a draft. Does this wording make sense to you?

-Melina

**From:** Aida Montano  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 02, 2019 1:56 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina <Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov>  
**Subject:** For budget omnibus amendment

Melina,

Attached is a rough draft of the requested amendment. I could not find definitions of "nature" or "ecosystem" in Ohio statutes or cases. The definitions in the draft are compiled from various dictionary definitions. Statutory construction rules state that ordinary dictionary meanings of terms are considered in construing a statute.

Also, the statement that nature and ecosystem do not have standing is not necessary since that is already the case. The draft is worded so that no person, on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem, shall bring, defend, or intervene in an action in the court of common pleas.

Please let me know of any comments or changes, so I can finalize the amendment and submit it to my supervisor today in light of the tight schedule.

Thank you,

Aida Montano

Research Associate  
LSC 466-5663

**Tornero, Melina**

---

**From:** Tornero, Melina  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 02, 2019 2:06 PM  
**To:** 'Zack Frymier'  
**Subject:** FW: For budget omnibus amendment  
**Attachments:** Draft 2305.011.docx

Hi Zach,

LSC sent this to me as a draft. Does this wording make sense to you?

-Melina

**From:** Aida Montano  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 02, 2019 1:56 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina <Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov>  
**Subject:** For budget omnibus amendment

Melina,

Attached is a rough draft of the requested amendment. I could not find definitions of "nature" or "ecosystem" in Ohio statutes or cases. The definitions in the draft are compiled from various dictionary definitions. Statutory construction rules state that ordinary dictionary meanings of terms are considered in construing a statute.

Also, the statement that nature and ecosystem do not have standing is not necessary since that is already the case. The draft is worded so that no person, on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem, shall bring, defend, or intervene in an action in the court of common pleas.

Please let me know of any comments or changes, so I can finalize the amendment and submit it to my supervisor today in light of the tight schedule.

Thank you,

Aida Montano  
Research Associate  
LSC 466-5663

Draft

Sec. 2305.011. (A) As used in this section:

(1) "Nature" means the phenomena of the physical world collectively, including plants, animals, the landscape, other features and products of the earth, the natural environment or wilderness, and generally areas that are not human or human creations, have not been substantially altered by humans, or that persist despite human intervention.

(2) "Ecosystem" means a complex community of living organisms in conjunction with their physical environments, all interacting and linked together as a system through nutrient cycles and energy flows in a particular unit of space.

(B) (1) No person, on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem, shall bring an action in a court of common pleas.

(2) No person shall bring an action in a court of common pleas against a person who is acting on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem.

(3) No person, on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem, shall intervene in any manner in any action brought in a court of common pleas.

(C) Nothing in this section shall be construed to prevent the state or any of its agencies from enforcing the laws pertaining to environmental pollution, conservation, wild animals, or other natural communities or ecosystems.

## Tornero, Melina

---

**From:** Aida Montano  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 02, 2019 1:56 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina  
**Subject:** For budget omnibus amendment  
**Attachments:** Draft 2305.011.docx

Melina,

Attached is a rough draft of the requested amendment. I could not find definitions of "nature" or "ecosystem" in Ohio statutes or cases. The definitions in the draft are compiled from various dictionary definitions. Statutory construction rules state that ordinary dictionary meanings of terms are considered in construing a statute.

Also, the statement that nature and ecosystem do not have standing is not necessary since that is already the case. The draft is worded so that no person, on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem, shall bring, defend, or intervene in an action in the court of common pleas.

Please let me know of any comments or changes, so I can finalize the amendment and submit it to my supervisor today in light of the tight schedule.

Thank you,

Aida Montano  
Research Associate  
LSC 466-5663

Draft

Sec. 2305.011. (A) As used in this section:

(1) "Nature" means the phenomena of the physical world collectively, including plants, animals, the landscape, other features and products of the earth, the natural environment or wilderness, and generally areas that are not human or human creations, have not been substantially altered by humans, or that persist despite human intervention.

(2) "Ecosystem" means a complex community of living organisms in conjunction with their physical environments, all interacting and linked together as a system through nutrient cycles and energy flows in a particular unit of space.

(B) (1) No person, on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem, shall bring an action in a court of common pleas.

(2) No person shall bring an action in a court of common pleas against a person who is acting on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem.

(3) No person, on behalf of or representing nature or an ecosystem, shall intervene in any manner in any action brought in a court of common pleas.

(C) Nothing in this section shall be construed to prevent the state or any of its agencies from enforcing the laws pertaining to environmental pollution, conservation, wild animals, or other natural communities or ecosystems.

## Tornero, Melina

---

**From:** Zack Frymier <zfrymier@ohiochamber.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 11, 2019 2:47 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina  
**Subject:** RE: Chairman Hoops request

I'll come over! Thank you!

**From:** Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov <Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov>  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 11, 2019 2:46 PM  
**To:** Zack Frymier <zfrymier@ohiochamber.com>  
**Subject:** RE: Chairman Hoops request

Hi Zack,

If you have time today we have a 4:00 open before Rep Hoops heads home.

-Melina

**From:** Zack Frymier <zfrymier@ohiochamber.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 11, 2019 2:11 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina <Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov>  
**Subject:** Chairman Hoops request

Melina,

I hope you are doing well and surviving the budget! I'm hoping to find some time (like everyone else) to run something by Chairman Hoops regarding the Lake Erie Bill of Rights that passed in Toledo in February. We have some language that we'd request be considered for the budget. Though obviously it would have to be submitted after tomorrow's deadline we'd still like to have a conversation.

Let me know if we are able to get something on the calendar or what's the best way to get in touch with him.

Thank you and feel free to give me a call!  
Zack

OHIO  
CHAMBER  
of COMMERCE

Zachary Frymier • Director, Energy and Environmental Policy  
Ohio Chamber of Commerce  
34 S. Third St., Suite 100  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614.228.4201 office  
614.629.0925 direct  
www.ohiochamber.com  
[www.allforohio.com](http://www.allforohio.com)

**Tornero, Melina**

**From:** Tornero, Melina  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 11, 2019 2:46 PM  
**To:** 'Zack Frymier'  
**Subject:** RE: Chairman Hoops request

Hi Zack,

If you have time today we have a 4:00 open before Rep Hoops heads home.

-Melina

**From:** Zack Frymier <zfrymier@ohiochamber.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 11, 2019 2:11 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina <Melina.Tornero@ohiohouse.gov>  
**Subject:** Chairman Hoops request

Melina,

I hope you are doing well and surviving the budget! I'm hoping to find some time (like everyone else) to run something by Chairman Hoops regarding the Lake Erie Bill of Rights that passed in Toledo in February. We have some language that we'd request be considered for the budget. Though obviously it would have to be submitted after tomorrow's deadline we'd still like to have a conversation.

Let me know if we are able to get something on the calendar or what's the best way to get in touch with him.

Thank you and feel free to give me a call!

Zack

OHIO  
CHAMBER  
of COMMERCE

Zachary Frymier • Director, Energy and Environmental Policy  
Ohio Chamber of Commerce

34 S. Third St., Suite 100

Columbus, OH 43215

614.228.4201 office

614.629.0925 direct

[www.ohiochamber.com](http://www.ohiochamber.com)

[www.allforohio.com](http://www.allforohio.com)



**Tornero, Melina**

**From:** Zack Frymier <zfrymier@ohiochamber.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, April 11, 2019 2:11 PM  
**To:** Tornero, Melina  
**Subject:** Chairman Hoops request

Melina,

I hope you are doing well and surviving the budget! I'm hoping to find some time (like everyone else) to run something by Chairman Hoops regarding the Lake Erie Bill of Rights that passed in Toledo in February. We have some language that we'd request be considered for the budget. Though obviously it would have to be submitted after tomorrow's deadline we'd still like to have a conversation.

Let me know if we are able to get something on the calendar or what's the best way to get in touch with him.

Thank you and feel free to give me a call!

Zack

OHIO  
CHAMBER  
of COMMERCE

Zachary Frymier • Director, Energy and Environmental Policy  
Ohio Chamber of Commerce  
34 S. Third St., Suite 100  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614.228.4201 office  
614.629.0925 direct  
[www.ohiochamber.com](http://www.ohiochamber.com)  
[www.allforohio.com](http://www.allforohio.com)